

NORMAL SUBGROUPS AND PERMUTATION CHARACTERS: A CORRECTION TO A PROOF OF KLINGEN

PETER MÜLLER AND PABLO SPIGA

ABSTRACT. Let G be a finite group. For subgroups U and V let 1_U^G and 1_V^G be the permutation characters for the action of G on the right cosets of U and V , respectively. Let N be a normal subgroup of G . Norbert Klingen, in his book [4], shows that if $1_U^G = 1_V^G$, then $1_{UN}^G = 1_{VN}^G$. We give a counterexample to an argument in his proof and provide a correct proof for this statement.

1. INTRODUCTION

Many questions on Kronecker classes, and more generally in algebraic number theory, can be phrased in purely group-theoretic terms. Examples can be found, for instance, in the work of Jehne [3] and Perlis [5]. Norbert Klingen, in his beautiful book [4], further explores these connections and provides a comprehensive treatment of this area, offering a monograph that remains highly valuable today.

One particularly relevant situation that arises in the study of arithmetic similarities is the equality $1_U^G = 1_V^G$ between permutation characters. In this context, Klingen states the following result.

Theorem 1 (Theorem 1.6 (a), page 83, [4]). *Let G be a finite group, let U and V be subgroups of G , let 1_U^G and 1_V^G be the permutation characters for the action of G on the right cosets of U and V respectively and let N be a normal subgroup. If $1_U^G = 1_V^G$, then $1_{UN}^G = 1_{VN}^G$.*

However, the proof of this theorem is not correct. Indeed, the smallest counterexample to the essential step in Klingen's proof is the following (we use the notation from [4, page 83], except that we prefer to use the letter N to denote the normal subgroup H in the proof of [4, Theorem 1.6 (a)]). Let $G = \langle x \rangle$ be cyclic of order 4, let U be the identity subgroup of G , let $N = \langle x^2 \rangle$, and let $\sigma = x^2$. Then $\sigma \in UN$, so $1_{UN}^G(\sigma) > 0$, while $1_U^G(\sigma) = 0$. Therefore, [4, equality (14)] does not hold.

Theorem 1, which is an immediate consequence of the following Lemma 2, is very relevant for inductive arguments.

Lemma 2. *Let U be a subgroup of the finite group G , and let N be a normal subgroup of G . Then*

$$1_{UN}^G(g) = \frac{1}{|N|} \sum_{n \in N} 1_U^G(gn) \text{ for all } g \in G.$$

2. PROOF OF LEMMA 2

Lemma 2 is a version of Lemma 3 below which first appeared in the work by Fried, Guralnick and Saxl on exceptional permutation polynomials, see [1, proof of Lemma 13.1]. Its original proof employed representation theoretic arguments. It was later proved again in [2, Lemma 3.1] by a short counting argument.

Lemma 3 (Fried, Guralnick, Saxl). *Let the finite group H act on the finite set Ω , let N be a normal subgroup of H , let $\pi(h)$ be the number of fixed points of $h \in H$ on Ω , and assume that $H = \langle N, g \rangle$ for some $g \in H$. Let r be the number of H -orbits on Ω which do not split into smaller N -orbits. Then*

$$\frac{1}{|N|} \sum_{n \in N} \pi(gn) = r.$$

Note that Lemma 2 follows from this result: Let Ω be set of right cosets of U in G and set $H = \langle N, g \rangle$. Then $1_U^G = \pi$ and $1_{U_N}^G(g)$ is the number of N -orbits on Ω fixed by g . As $H = \langle N, g \rangle$, these are exactly the H -orbits which do not split into smaller N -orbits.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The second author is funded by the European Union via the Next Generation EU (Mission 4 Component 1 CUP B53D23009410006, PRIN 2022, 2022PSTWLB, Group Theory and Applications).

REFERENCES

- [1] M. D. Fried, R. Guralnick, J. Saxl, *Schur covers and Carlitz's conjecture*, Israel J. Math. **82** (1993), 157–225.
- [2] R. Guralnick, D. Wan, *Bounds for fixed point free elements in a transitive group and applications to curves over finite fields*, Israel J. Math. **101** (1997), 255–287.
- [3] W. Jehne, *Kronecker classes of algebraic number fields*, J. Number Theory **9** (1977), 279–320.
- [4] N. Klingen, *Arithmetical Similarities Prime Decomposition and Finite Group Theory*, Oxford Science Publications, Clarendon Press, 1998.
- [5] R. Perlis, *On the equation $\zeta_K(s) = \zeta_{K'}(s)$* , J. Number Theory **9** (1977), 342–360.

INSTITUT FÜR MATHEMATIK, UNIVERSITÄT WÜRZBURG, 97074 WÜRZBURG, GERMANY
Email address: peter.mueller@uni-wuerzburg.de

DIPARTIMENTO DI MATEMATICA E APPLICAZIONI, UNIVERSITY OF MILANO-BICOCCA, VIA COZZI 55, 20125 MILANO, ITALY
Email address: pablo.spiga@unimib.it